IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF ALABAMA SOUTHERN DIVISION

JAMES N. STRAWSER, et al.,)
Plaintiffs,))
v.	Civil Action No. 14-0424-CG-C
LUTHER STRANGE, in his)
Official Capacity as Attorney)
General for the State of)
Alabama, et al.,)
)
Defendants.)

DEFENDANT PROBATE JUDGE TIM RUSSELL'S RESPONSE TO PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR PERMANENT INJUNCTION AND FINAL JUDGMENT

COMES NOW Tim Russell, in his official capacity as Probate Judge of Baldwin County, both individually and as a class representative, and hereby respectfully submits this Response to Plaintiff's Motion for Permanent Injunction, as follows:

1. Judge Russell has resumed issuing marriage licenses to same-sex couples on the same priority and in the same manner as those licenses are issued to couples of the opposite sex. It is important to note that neither Judge Russell nor

any other probate judge has ever presented an argument as to the substance of Plaintiffs' claims, i.e., whether Alabama's marital sanctity laws violate the Fourteenth Amendment to the United States Constitution, to this Court, and they would not have the authority to do so, as defending the constitutionality of Alabama's laws are the provenance of the Attorney General. Obviously, this question was definitively answered by Obergefell v. Hodges, 576 U.S. ____, No. 14-556, 2015 WL 2473451 (June 26, 2015).

2. Judge Russell maintains that the claims brought against him, both individually and as a class representative, should have been dismissed for the reasons stated in his Motion to Dismiss and Motion for Reconsideration, which are adopted and incorporated by reference as if stated fully herein. (Docs. 108-109, 114.) He has timely appealed the denial of these Motions and the entry of the preliminary injunction. (Doc. 127). Further, Judge Russell has filed a Petition for Permissive Appeal as to the issue of class certification with the Eleventh Circuit, arguing that the certification of the Defendant class and his appointment as a Class Representative were improper for several reasons, including the fact that he was never allowed an opportunity to oppose the Motion for Class Certification, which was filed before he was a Defendant in this case and therefore was never

served on him as required by the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. In light of these pending appeals, the entry of a permanent injunction and final judgment would be premature.

3. The entry of an injunction against a Defendant class is also inappropriate in light of the fact that Alabama's probate judges have taken three separate approaches to the circus surrounding the issuance of same-sex marriage licenses. Some judges, like Judge Russell, began issuing the licenses immediately after the entry of this Court's initial Orders in this case and in *Searcy*, issued them until they were enjoined from doing so by the Alabama Supreme Court, and began issuing them again after Obergefell; some judges, prior to the issuance of the preliminary injunction (Doc. 123), ceased issuing all marriage licenses; and some judges never issued same-sex marriage licenses but continued issuing opposite sex marriage licenses. This Court has previously stated that judges taking the second approach violated neither the Orders of this Court nor those of the Alabama Supreme Court, thus mooting any claims against them. (Doc. 123, pg. 10, n.3.)

WHEREFORE, THESE PREMISES CONSIDERED, Defendant Tim Russell, in his official capacity as Probate Judge of Baldwin County, Alabama,

individually and as a class representative, hereby objects to the entry of a permanent injunction and final judgment in this case.

s/Kendrick E. Webb

KENDRICK E. WEBB (WEB022)
JAMIE HELEN KIDD (HIL060)
Attorneys for Defendant Tim Russell
WEBB & ELEY, P.C.
7475 Halcyon Pointe Drive (36117)
Post Office Box 240909
Montgomery, Alabama 36124
(334) 262-1850 T
(334) 262-1772 F
kwebb@webbeley.com
jkidd@webbeley.com

OF COUNSEL:

JOHN DAVID WHETSTONE 17090 Lagoon Winds Drive Gulf Shores, AL 36542 T (251) 500-1337 davidwhetstone1@yahoo.com

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on this the 7th day of July, 2015, I have electronically filed the foregoing with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system, which will provide notice to the following CM/ECF participants:

Shannon P. Minter Christopher F. Stoll National Center for Lesbian Rights 1100 H. Street, NW, Suite 540 Washington, DC 20005 T (202) 734-3545 sminter@nclrights.org cstoll@nclrights.org

Heather Fann
Boyd, Fernambucq, Dunn & Fann
3500 Blue Lake Drive, Suite 220
Birmingham, AL 35243
T (205) 930-9000
F (205) 930-9010
hfann@bfattorneys.net

Ayesha N. Khan
Zachary A. Dietert
Americans United for Separation of
Church and State
1901 L. Street, N.W., Suite 400
Washington, DC 20036
T 202-466-3234
khan@au.org
dietert@au.org

David Dinielli Scott D. McCoy Southern Poverty Law Center 400 Washington Avenue Montgomery, AL 36104 T 334-956-8200 david.dinnielli@splcenter.org scott.mccoy@splcenter.org

Randall C. Marshall ACLE Foundation of Alabama P. O. Box 6179 Montgomery, AL 36106 T (334) 420-1741 F (334) 269-5666 rmarshall@aclualabama.org

James W. Davis
Office of the Attorney General
501 Washington Avenue
Montgomery, AL 36130
T (334) 353-1356
F (334) 353-8440
jimdavis@ago.state.al.us

Laura Elizabeth Howell 501 Washington Avenue Montgomery, AL 36104 T (334) 242-7432 lhowell@ago.state.al.us

Joesph Michael Druhan, Jr. Johnston Druhan, LLP P. O. Box 154 Mobile, AL 36601 T (251) 432-0738 mike@satterwhitelaw.com

Harry V. Satterwhite Satterwhite & Tyler, LLC 1325 Dauphin Street Mobile, AL 36604 T (251) 432-8120 F (251) 405-0147 harry@satterwhitelaw.com Andrew L. Brasher 501 Washington Avenue Montgomery, AL 36103 T (334) 242-7300 abrasher@ago.state.al.us

Mark S. Boardman
Clay Richard Carr
Teresa Bearden Petelos
Boardman, Carr, Bennett, Watkins,
Hill & Gamble, P.C.
400 Boardman Drive
Chelsea, AL 35043
T (205) 678-8000
F (205) 678-8000
mboardman@boardmancarr.com
ccarr@boardmancarr.com
tpetelos@boardmancarr.com

Lee L. Hale
Hale and Hughes
501 Church Street
Mobile, AL 36602
T (251) 433-3671
F (251) 432-1982
Lee.hale@comcast.net

Teresa Bearden Petelos 400 Boardman Drive Chelsea, AL 35043 T (205) 678-8000 tpetelos@boardmancarr.com French Andrew McMillan
Jeffrey M. Sewell
Sewell Sewell McMillan
1841 Second Avenue South, Suite 214
Jasper, AL 355012
T (205) 544-2350
F (205) 544-2345
french@sewellmcmillan.com
jeff@sewellmcmillan.com

s/Kendrick E. Webb OF COUNSEL